

Machiavelli and Modern Politics



§1 Life and Background

- Life: 1469-1524
 - Florence, Renaissance Italy
 - Major Ruling Family: Medici Family
 - 1494: Invasion of French King Charles VIII.
 - 1494-1512 Florence Republic
-

§1 Life and Background

- Machiavelli served for the republic as secretary to the Second Chancery, which direct the general interior affairs and war.
 - 1512: Medici Family regained control and the republic ended.
-

§1 Life and Background

- In 1512 Machiavelli, was put in prison and then exiled (till death) from Florence for his connection with the republic.
 - Major Works in political philosophy:
 - *The Prince* (hoping to gain the favor of Medici family)
 - *Discourses on Livy*
-

§1.1 Letter to Vettori (很快看過)

When evening has come, I return to my house and go into my study. At the door I take off my clothes of the day, covered with mud and mire, and I put on my regal and courtly garments; and decently reclothed, I enter the ancient courts of ancient men, where, received by them lovingly, ***I feed on the food that alone is mine and that I was born for.***

§1.1 Letter to Vettori

□ There I am not ashamed to speak with them and to ask them the reason for their actions; and they in their humanity reply to me. And for the space of four hours I feel no boredom, I forget every pain, I do not fear poverty, death does not frighten me. I deliver myself entirely to them.

§1.1 Letter to Vettori

- And because Dante says that to have understood without retaining does not make knowledge, I have noted what capital I have made from their conversation and have composed a little work *De Principatibus* (*On Principalities*), where I delve as deeply as I can into reflections on this subject,
-

§1.1 Letter to Vettori

- ***debating what a principality is, of what kinds they are. How they are acquired, how they are maintained, why they are lost.***
And if you have ever been pleased by any of my whimsies, this one should not displease you; and to a prince, and especially to a new prince, it should be welcome.
-

§ 1.1 Letter to Vettori

- So I am addressing it to his Magnificence, Giuliano. Filippo Casavecchia has seen it; he can give you an account in part both of the thing in itself and of the discussions I had with him, although I am all the time fattening and polishing it.
-

馬基維利書齋



§2 Opening *The Prince*(P:1)

- All **states**, all dominions that have held and hold empire over men have been and are either **republics** or **principalities**. The principalities are either *hereditary*,... or they are **new**. The new ones are either altogether new, or they are like members added to the hereditary state of the prince who **acquires** them....
-

§2 Opening *The Prince*

- Dominions so **acquired** are either in the habit of living under a prince or used to being free (i.e. republics); and they are acquired either with the arms of others or with one's own, either with **fortune** or by **virtue**.
 - **Principality vs. Republic** 政體二元對立的新分類
-

§2 Acquisition: Natural **and** Praised

- Truly it is a very natural and ordinary thing to **desire to acquire**, and always, when men do it who can, they will be praised or not blamed; but when they cannot, and want to do it anyway, here lie the error and the blame.
 - * 換言之，成敗取代西賽羅的 *honestum*.
-

§3 Machiavelli's Cosmology (P:25)

- It is not unknown to me that many have held and hold the opinion that worldly things are so governed by **fortune and by God**, that men cannot correct them with their prudence, indeed that they have no remedy at all; and on account of this they might judge that one need not sweat much over things but let oneself be governed by **chance**.
-

§3 Machiavelli's Cosmology

- Nonetheless, in order that our *free will* not be eliminated, I judge that it might be true that ***fortune is arbiter of half of our actions***, but also that she leaves the other half, or close to it, for us to govern.
-

§3 Machiavelli's Cosmology

- I conclude, thus, that when fortune varies and men remain obstinate in their modes, men are prosperous while they are in accord, and as they come into discord, unprosperous.
-

§3 Machiavelli's Cosmology

- I judge this indeed, that it is better to be impetuous than cautious, because **fortune is a woman**; and it is necessary, if one wants to hold her down, to beat her and strike her down.
 - 性別政治：The need of **virtù** (etymology：男性氣概)
-

§4.1 The Task of Highest Politics (P:6)=Founder in D.I:9 ff

- And as one examines their actions and lives (Moses, Cyrus, Ramulus, and Theseus), one does **not** see that they had anything else from **fortune** than the **opportunity**, which gave them the matter enabling them to introduce **any form they pleased**. Without that opportunity their **virtue of spirit** would have been eliminated, and without that virtue the opportunity would have come in vain.
-

§4.2 核心政治議題： Introducing New Order

It should be considered that nothing is more difficult to handle, more doubtful of success, nor more dangerous to manage, than to put oneself at the head of **introducing new orders**. For the introducer has all those who benefit from the old orders as enemies, and he has lukewarm defenders in all those who might benefit from the new orders.

§4.3 Good Foundations (P:12)

- We have said above that it is necessary for a prince to have good foundations for himself; otherwise he must of necessity be ruined. The principal **foundations** that all **states** have, new ones as well as old or mixed, are **good laws** and **good arms**.
-

§4.3 Good Foundations

- And because there cannot be good laws where there are not good arms, and ***where there are good arms there must be good laws***, I shall leave out the reasoning on laws and shall speak of arms.
-

§5 新政治道德 : Machiavelli's New Doctrine of Virtue (P:15 ff)

It remains now to see what the modes and government of a prince should be with subjects and with friends. And because I know that *many have written of this*, I fear that in writing of it again, I may be held presumptuous, especially since in disputing this matter I depart from the orders of others.

§5 “Effectual Truth”

But since my intent is to write something **useful** to whoever understands it, it has appeared to me more fitting to go directly to the **effectual truth of the thing** than to the **imagination** of it. And many have imagined republics and principalities that have never been seen or known to exist in truth;

§5 Denial of Classical Values

for it is so far from **how one lives** to **how one should live** that he who lets go of what is done for what should be done learns his ruin rather than his preservation. For a man who wants to make *a profession of good* in all regards must come to ruin *among so many who are not good*.

§5 Denial of Classical Values

*Hence it is necessary to a prince, if he wants to maintain himself, to **learn to be able not to be good**, and to use this and not use it **according to necessity**.*

§5.1 Parody on Cicero (P:18)

There are two kinds of combat: one with **laws**, the other with **force**. The first is proper to man, the second to beasts; but because the first is often not enough, one must have recourse to the second. Therefore it is **necessary** for a prince to know well how to use the beast and the man.

§5.1 Parody on Cicero ("arcana imperii" 統治密術)

- This role was taught covertly to princes by ancient writers, who wrote that **Achilles**, were given to **Chiron the centaur to be raised**, so that he would look after them with his discipline. To have as teacher a half-beast, half-man means nothing other than that *a prince needs to know how to use both natures; and the one without the other is not lasting.*
-

§5.1 Parody on Cicero

- Thus, since a prince is compelled of **necessity** to know well how to use the **beast**, he should pick the **fox** and the **lion**, because the lion does not defend itself from snares and the fox does not defend itself from wolves. So one needs to be a fox to recognize snares and a lion to frighten the wolves.
-

§5.1 Parody on Cicero

- And *if all men were good*, this teaching would not be good; but *because they are wicked* and do not observe faith with you, you also do not have to observe it with them. Nor does a prince ever lack legitimate causes to color his failure to observe faith.
-

§5.1 Parody on Cicero

- But it is necessary to know well how to *color this nature*, and to be **a great pretender and dissembler**; and men are so simple and so obedient to present necessities that he who deceives will always find someone who will let himself be deceived.
-

§6.1 Virtue of “Dissemblance”

- Thus, it is ***not necessary*** for a prince ***to have*** all the above-mentioned qualities ***in fact***, but it is indeed ***necessary to appear to have them***. Nay, I dare say this, that by having them and always observing them, they are ***harmful***;
-

§6.1 Virtue of “Dissemblance”

- and by appearing to have them, they are ***useful***, as it is to appear merciful, faithful, humane, honest, and religious, and to be so; but to remain with a ***spirit*** built so that, if you need not to be those things, you are able and know how to change to the contrary.
-

§6.2 “Machiavellism”馬基維利主義

- **This has to be understood:** that a prince, and especially a **new** prince, cannot observe all those things for which men are held good, since he is often *under a necessity, to **maintain his state**, of acting against faith, against charity, against humanity, against religion.*
-

§6.2 “Machiavellism”

- And so he needs to have a **spirit** disposed to change as the winds of fortune and variations of things command him, and as I said above, **not depart from good, when possible, but know how to enter into evil, when forced by necessity.**
-

§6.3 Justifying “Machiavellism”

- Men ***in general*** judge more by their eyes than by their hands, because seeing is given to everyone, touching to few. Everyone sees how you appear, few touch what you are; and these few dare not oppose the opinion of many, who have the majesty of the state to defend them;

§6.3 Justifying “Machiavellism”

- and in the actions of all men, and especially of princes, ***where there is no court to appeal to, one looks to the end***. So let a prince ***win and maintain his state***: ***the means will always be judged honorable, and will be praised by everyone.*** (cf. Cicero)

§6.4 “End” of Machiavellism

- When the things above have been observed prudently, they make a new prince **appear** ancient and immediately render him more secure and steady in his **state** than if he had grown old in it....
-

§6.4 “End” of Machiavellism

- And so he will have the **double glory** of having made the *beginning* of a new principality, of having adorned it **and consolidated** it with good laws, good arms, good friends, and good examples. (P:24)
 - 問題：嗜血的「新君主」是否有「德行」？
 - 例子：Cesare Borgia (P: VII), Agathocles (P: VIII)
-

§6.5 The Situation of Italy (P: 26)

Title: “*Exhortation to Seize Italy and to Free Her from the Barbarians*” 實際訴求

Thus, having considered everything discussed above, and thinking to myself whether in Italy at present the times have been tending to the honor of a new prince, and whether

§6.5 The Situation of Italy

□ there is matter to give ***opportunity*** to someone prudent and virtuous to ***introduce a form*** that would bring ***honor to him*** and ***good to the community of men there***, it appears to me that so many things are tending to the benefit of a new prince that I do not know what time has ever been more apt for it.

§6.5 The Situation of Italy

- So at present to know ***the virtue of an Italian spirit*** it was necessary that Italy be reduced to the condition in which she is at present, which is more enslaved than the Hebrews, more servile than the Persians, more dispersed than the Athenians, without a head, without order, beaten, despoiled, torn, pillaged, and having endured ruin of every sort.
-

§6.6 The possible role of Medici

- Nor may one see at present anyone in whom she can hope more than in your illustrious house (***i.e. the Medici Family***), which with its ***fortune and virtue***, supported by God and by the Church of which it is now prince, can put itself at the head of this redemption. This is not very difficult if you summon up the actions and lives of those named above.
-

§6.6 The possible role of Medici

- And it is not a marvel if none of the Italians named before has been able to do what it is hoped will be done by your illustrious house, and if in so many **revolutions** in Italy and in so many maneuvers of war, it always appears that military virtue has died out in her.
-

§6.6 The possible role of Medici

- This arises from the fact that **her ancient orders were not good (the Church?)**, and that there has not been anyone who has known how to find new ones; nothing brings so much honor to a man rising newly as the **new laws and the new orders found by him**.
-

§6.7 The Redeemer of Italy

- When these things have been founded well and have greatness in them, they make him revered and admirable. And in Italy matter is not lacking for introducing every form; here there is great virtue in the limbs, if it were not lacking in the heads.
-

§6.8 Patriotism: Redeeming Italy

- Thus, one should not let this opportunity pass, for Italy, after so much time, to see her **redeemer**. Then may your illustrious house take up this task with the spirit and hope in which just enterprises are taken up, so that under its emblem this **fatherland** may be ennobled.
 - 科學的冷靜與愛國熱情相容否？
-

《君主論》總結

- 「政治」的課題：不依賴自然法與神聖法
 - 人性論的假設
 - 統治者的「德行」
 - 「機運」及其克服
 - 政治開端與正當性
 - 統治者與其統治對象 (*lo stato*)
 - 現代「政治科學」的開端？
 - 新政治道德，「技術性」與國家理性
-

§7 From Principality to Republic (D, II:2)

- It is an easy thing to know whence arises among peoples this affection for the free way of life, for *it is seen through experience that cities have never **expanded either in dominion or in riches if they have not been in freedom.***
-

§7 From Principality to Republic

- It is very marvelous to consider how much greatness Rome arrived at after it was freed from its kings. The reason is easy to understand, for ***it is not the particular good but the common good that makes cities great***. And without doubt this common good is not observed if not in republics, since all that is for that purpose is executed.
-

§7 小結：幾種政治力量

- 關鍵問題：共善如何達成？對馬基維利而言，這是一個動態過程，或動態平衡：
 - **Prince**: kingly hand; creating order
 - **People**: goodness via laws and religion; will to freedom; maintaining republican order
 - **“Great”** (權貴) : ambition, will to domination, to be curbed
-

§8 People vs. Prince

If **princes** are superior to peoples in **ordering** laws, forming civil lives, and ordering new statutes and orders, **peoples** are so much superior in **maintaining** things ordered that without doubt they attain the glory of those who order them.

§9 The Advantage of Class Conflict (I:4)

I say that to me it appears that those who damn the **tumults between the nobles and the plebs** blame those things that were the first cause of keeping Rome free, and that they consider the noises and the cries that would arise in such tumults more than the **good effects** that they engendered.

§9 The Advantage of Class Conflict (I:4)

They do not consider that in every republic are two diverse **humors**, that of the **people** and that of the **great**, and that all the laws that are made in favor of freedom arise from **their disunion**, as can easily be seen to have occurred in Rome.

§9 The Advantage of Class Conflict (I:6)

- If the Roman state had come to be quieter, this inconvenience would have followed: that it would also have been weaker because it cut off the way by which it could come to the **greatness** it achieved, so that **if Rome wished to remove the cause of tumults, it removed too the causes of expansion.** (I:6)
-

§10 The “Beginning”

- III.1 “If One Wishes a Sect or a Republic to Live Long, It Is Necessary to Draw It Back Often toward Its Beginning”
 - It is a very true thing that all worldly things have a limit to their life; but generally those go the whole course that is ordered for them by heaven,
-

§10 The “Beginning”

that do not disorder their body but keep it ordered so that either it does not alter or, if it alters, it is for its safety and not to its harm. Because I am speaking of mixed bodies, such as **republics** and **sects**, I say that those alterations are for safety that lead them back toward their ***beginnings*** (*principio*).

§10 The “Beginning”

- For all the ***beginnings*** of sects, republics, and kingdoms must have some ***goodness*** in them, by means of which they may regain their first reputation and their first increase. Because in the process of time that goodness is ***corrupted***, unless something intervenes to lead it back to the mark, it of necessity kills that body.
-

§10 The “Beginning”

- It is thus necessary, as was said, that men who live together in any order whatever often examine themselves either through these *extrinsic* accidents or through *intrinsic* ones. As to the latter, it must arise **either** from a ***law*** that often looks over the account for the men who are in that body,
-

§10 The “Beginning”

- **or** indeed from **a good man** who arises among them, who with his examples and his virtuous works produces the same effect as the order. Thus this good emerges in republics either through the **virtue of a man** or through **the virtue of an order**.
-

§10 The “Beginning”

- Such **orders** have *need of being brought to life by the virtue of a citizen* (仍依賴於人) who rushes spiritedly to execute them against the power of those who transgress them. Notable among such executions,... were the **death of the sons of Brutus**,...(D.III:3)
-

§11 Machiavelli's Idea of "Order"

- 只有共和制才有“ order”（制度性秩序）
 - **(D. I:18)** :To make this part better understood, I say that in Rome there was the ***order of the government***, or truly ***of the state***, and afterward the ***laws***, which together with the magistrates checked the citizens.
-

§11 Machiavelli's Idea of "Order"

- The ***order of the state*** was the authority of the people, of the Senate, of the tribunes, of the consuls; the mode of soliciting and creating the magistrates; and the mode of making the laws. These orders varied hardly or not at all in accidents.
-

§11 Machiavelli's Idea of "Order"

- The **laws** that checked the citizens varied -- such as the law on ambition and many others -- as the citizens little by little became corrupt. *But by holding steady the orders of the state, which in corruption were no longer good, the laws that were renewed were no longer enough to keep men good;*

§11 Machiavelli's Idea of "Order"

- but they would indeed have helped if the orders had been changed together with the innovation in laws.
- If Rome wished to maintain itself free in corruption, therefore, it was necessary that ***it should have made new orders***, as in the course of its life it had made new laws.

§12 “Ordering” and Politics of Extraordinary

- For one should order different orders and modes of life in a bad subject and in a good one; nor can there be a similar form in a matter altogether contrary. But because these orders have to be renewed either all **at a stroke**, when they are discovered to be no longer good, or **little by little**, before they are recognized by everyone,
-

§12 “Ordering” and Politics of Extraordinary

- I say that both of these two things are **almost** impossible.
 - As to innovating these orders at a stroke, when everyone knows that they are not good, I say that the uselessness, which is easily recognized, is difficult to correct.
-

§12“Ordering” and Politics of Extraordinary

- For to do this, it is not enough to use ordinary terms, since the ordinary modes are bad; but it is necessary to go to the **extraordinary**, such as **violence** and **arms**, and before everything else become prince of that city, able to dispose it in one's own mode.
-

§12 Paradigms of “Orderer”

- **Founder**: Moses, Ramulus and Numa
D. I:9; *Founder vs. Tyrant* (I:10)
 - **Renovator**: Brutus (D. I:16, III:1-3)
 - **Dictator** (**ordinary**, institutionalized power with kingly hand in a republic, *to temporize emergencies*) (D. I: 33-35)
-

§13 結論：The Perfect Republic (I:34)

In a republic, one would not wish anything ever to happen that has to be governed with **extraordinary modes**. For *although the extraordinary mode **may do good then**, nonetheless the example does ill*; for if one sets up a habit of breaking the orders for the sake of good, then later, under that coloring, they are broken for ill.

§13 結論：The Perfect Republic

So a republic will never be **perfect** unless ***it has provided for everything with its laws and has established a remedy for every accident and given the mode to govern it.***

§14 結論：國家理性 (*raison d'état*) 的先聲

- Where one deliberate entirely on the ***safety of his fatherland***, there ought not to enter any consideration of either just or unjust, merciful or cruel, praiseworthy or ignominious; indeed every other concern put aside, one ought to follow entirely the policy that saves its life and maintains its liberty. **(III:41)**

§14 總結

- 秩序高於規範，存在先於理性；
- 政治創新，變遷優於守成；
- 危機社會，（正當的）緊急權力適時運用；
- 君主與人民的二元對立格局；
- 政治共同體的秩序「想像」與現代國家尚有距離；
- 國家理性？
- 現代革命思想之淵源？